# A Comparative Analysis of German and Australian Climate Change Coverage in Quality Newspapers

Framing a political election and an environmental disaster

Appendices

Lena Birkenfeld



Universitätsverlag Ilmenau 2020

#### Imprint

#### **Bibliographic Information publishes by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek**

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de .

#### Detailed bibliographic data to the main work:

A Comparative Analysis of German and Australian Climate Change Coverage in Quality Newspapers – Framing a political election and an environmental disaster / Lena Birkenfeld Ilmenau: Universitätsverlag Ilmenau, 2020. – 248 Seiten. (NEU – Nachhaltigkeits-, Energie- und Umweltkommunikation; 6) ISSN 2197-6937 ISBN 978-3-86360-218-5 DOI 10.22032/dbt.43077 URN urn:nbn:de:gbv:ilm1-2019000637

Technische Universität Ilmenau/Universitätsbibliothek Universitatsverlag Ilmenau Postfach 10 05 65 98684 Ilmenau http://www.tu-ilmenau.de/universitaetsverlag

**DOI** 10.22032/dbt.43077 **URN** urn:nbn:de:gbv:ilm1-2019000641

## Content

Appendix A: Code book	5
Appendix B: Reliability Test	43
Appendix C: Calculation of the weighted average coefficient	

**Appendix A: Code book** 

ILMENAU UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY

# **Code book**

### A Comparative Analysis of German and Australian Climate Change Coverage in Quality Newspapers

Framing a political election and an environmental disaster

Lena Birkenfeld

#### Content

1.	Intro	duction	n	8
2.	Gen	eral ren	narks	9
3.	Basi	c Eleme	ents	10
	3.1	First st	age coding	10
	3.2		l Stage Coding	
		3.2.1	Problem Definition	
			Sub dimension: Climate change exists and is a problem	12
			Sub dimension: Climate change is a matter of controversial	12
			discussion	
			Sub dimension: Climate change is not fully examined	
			Sub dimension: Climate change exists, but is no problem	
		2 2 2	Sub dimension: Climate change does not exist	
		3.2.2	Causal interpretation (causes of climate change)	
			Sub dimension: Human activities (in general)	
			Sub dimension: Population increase	
			Sub dimension: Denying that humans are a possible cause	
			Sub dimension: Destruction of forests	
			Sub dimension: Emission of greenhouse gases	
			Sub dimension: Natural causes	18
			Sub dimension: Effects on nature: changes in biodiversity –	
			negative consequences	19
			Sub dimension: Effects on nature: changes in biodiversity –	•
			positive consequences	
			Sub dimension: Effects on nature: sea-level rise	
			Sub dimension: Effects on nature: forest fires	
			Sub dimension: Effects on nature: erosions	21
			Sub dimension: Effects on nature: results of warming (floods,	
			drought, ice melt etc.)	
			Sub dimension: Effects on weather: increase in temperature	22
			Sub dimension: Effects on weather: more extreme weather	23
			Sub dimension: Effects on humans: diseases, epidemics, death etc	23
			Sub dimension: Effects on humans: climate change	
			refugees/suffering of the poor	24
			Sub dimension: Effects on humans: future generations will be	
			climate change victims	
			Sub dimension: Effects on humans: water/food supply	25
			Sub dimension: Effects on economy: huge negative effects if we do	
			nothing, less negative effects if we fight climate change	25
			Sub dimension: Effects on economy: economical benefits	26
			Sub dimension: Effects on economy: economic problems including	
			costs	26
		3.2.4	Responsibility	27
			Sub dimension: Everybody is responsible	
			Sub dimension: Everybody is discharged from responsibility	28

	Sub dimension: Humans have moral deficits	. 28
	Sub dimension: Financial/economic aspects should not influence	
	activities combating climate change	. 29
	Sub dimension: Developed countries are responsible	
3.2.5	Treatment recommendation	. 30
	Sub dimension: Something must be done, in general	. 30
	Sub dimension: General reduction of greenhouse gases – national focus	. 31
	Sub dimension: General reduction of greenhouse gases –	
	international focus	. 31
	Sub dimension: Demand climate change policy – national focus	
	Sub dimension: Demand climate change policy – international	
	focus	. 32
	Sub dimension: Demand more responsibility by the	
	government/politicians	. 33
	Sub dimension: Replacing/displacing one energy source with	
	another	
	Sub dimension: Rewarding climate friendly behaviour	. 34
	Sub dimension: Something has to be done, but should not influence economic growth	34
	Sub dimension: Economic aspects must be changed because of	
	climate change/global warming (including greenwashing)	35
	Sub dimension: Nuclear energy helps to reduce emissions/fossil	
	fuel quarrying	35
	Sub dimension: Use of renewable energy	
	Sub dimension: Reduction of using fossil fuels	
	Sub dimension: Rebuilding the natural environment	
	Sub dimension: Take measures to mitigate the effects of climate	
	change	.37
	Sub dimension: Tips for preventing the effects of climate change	. 38
	Sub dimension: Increase in knowledge about climate change/global	
	warming	. 38
	Sub dimension: Scientific development	
	Sub dimension: Smaller personal carbon footprint	
	Sub dimension: Ask (the media) to stop publishing climate-change-	
	sceptic positions	. 40
	Sub dimension: No treatment required: the economy comes first	
	Sub dimension: No treatment required: there is no problem	

#### 1. Introduction

The quantitative analysis in this study concentrates on two German (SüddeutscheZeitung/ Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung) as well as two Australian (The Age/Sydney Morning Herald) national quality newspapers which were studied in terms of their climate change coverage. This climate change coverage relates to two events: an election as well as an environmental disaster.

The articles focusing on political change were evaluated six months before/after:

- 27 September 2009 (Germany): the election victory of the CDU/FDP coalition
- 3 December 2007 (Australia): the election victory of the Australian Labor Party

The context of the environmental disaster was examined six months before/after:

- May 2010 (Germany): the Oder floods
- December 2010 (Australia): the Queensland floods

The goal of this thesis was to find out whether these two events resulted in changes in framing climate change in German and Australian quality newspapers.

The keywords used to identify the articles for the frame analyses were "Klimawandel"/"climate change" and "Erderwärmung"/"global warming".

For the Australian articles the database Ebsco Host Megafile Premier was used, while for the German articles the online archives of the newspapers "SüddeutscheZeitung" and "Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung" provided the data. For the analysis, all journalistic genres were considered, except letters to the editor.

As the online archives of the newspapers were used, the research only focused on textual aspects, not on pictures. The content of the text as a whole was decisive, and not just parts of the coverage, such as only the headline.

#### 2. General remarks

The goal of this research is to identify the central message of each article and to identify units of meaning – the central environmental frames of Germany and Australia. Therefore, this research takes the definition of media scientist Robert Entman (1993) as a starting point for its methodology. For Entman,

"[to] frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation" (Entman 1993, p. 52).

These four aspects – problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation and treatment recommendation – are also the main dimensions of framing for the basic research. However, the aspect "causal interpretation" is divided into two parts: On the one hand, there are causal interpretations which focus on causes of climate change, for example, human activities as a reason for climate change, and, on the other hand, causal interpretations which refer to effects of climate change, for example, changes in biodiversity.

The included sub dimensions of problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation and treatment recommendation are based on a literature review as well as samples of coverage from German and Australian quality print media, using the key words "Klimawandel"/"climate change" and "Erderwärmung"/"global warming".

For the analyses, all journalistic genres will be considered, except letters to the editor. The content of the text as a whole is decisive, not only parts of the respective coverage, such as the headline.

#### 3. Basic Elements

3.1 First stage coding

#### Headline

For identifying the article, write down the headline.

Keyword used	
Klimawandel	1
Climate change	2
Erderwärmung	3
Global warming	4

Date	
dd.mm.yyyy	

Media	
Süddeutsche Zeitung	1
Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung	2
Sydney Morning Herald	3
The Age	4

The Article's Form of Expression				
The article is				
commenting.	1			
Definition: Commenting articles are opinion articles that use narratives. So, feature stories which show the life of a certain person are part of this category. Also, public relations material, such as interviews, speeches or articles which authors are political leaders or scien- tists, and, thus, show his/her personal opinion are com- menting. In addition, these articles are often written in first person, using "T" as well as "we".				
informing.	2			
Definition: Informing articles are factual articles. These articles include facts and data, cite different people as well as scientific results, legislation drafts, and opinion polls.				

Key players of the article Definition: All people connected with a statement about climate change are key players. Please identify the key players for each article.			
Key Player A			
Key Player B			
Key Player C			

#### 3.2 Second Stage Coding

#### 3.2.1 Problem Definition

The the concept of "*problem definition*" identifies how the issues "climate change" and "global warming" are represented in the selected print media. This dimension encompasses sub-dimensions which can be used to examine the basic views of the coverage in terms of "Klimawandel"/"climate change" and "Erderwärmung"/"global warming".

Select code 0 if the sub dimension is not mentioned in the article.

Select code 1 if the sub dimension appears in the selected coverage.

When the selected code is 1: identify the key player of the sub dimension

#### Sub dimension: Climate change exists and is a problem

The sub-dimension **Climate change exists and is a problem** shows that "climate change" and "global warming" are issues which cause challenges. One could also consider establishing, for example, a climate change commission.

Examples:

"Australia's major cities are lagging behind those in Europe, South Africa and the United States in rolling out programs to <u>tackle climate change</u>, a new global report reveals." (The Age, 12.06.2012)

"Insbesondere die <u>Folgen des Klimawandels</u> und eingeschleppte Arten sind nach IUCN-Angaben nur schwer rückgängig zu machen." (FAZ, 19.06.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

Sub dimension: Climate change is a matter of controversial discussion

The sub-dimension **Climate change is a subject of controversial debate** asks whether "climate change" and "global warming" really exist. In doing so, it gives the climate-change-sceptical position publicity as a different scientific opinion about "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"One rank-and-file Liberal member was given rousing applause when he said global warming was a natural phenomenon and the theory that human activity had caused it was 'absolute rubbish'. ... The grassroots debate highlights the huge task Mr Turnbull faces as he tries to bring his party with him on amendments to the Government's carbon pollution reduction scheme." (The Age, 08.11.2009)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Climate change is not fully examined

The sub-dimension **Climate change is not fully examined** states, for example, that there is no clear evidence about the existence and the consequences of climate change.

Example:

"The problem with <u>climate change is that because it is a concept, a theory, a belief</u>, it provides a blank piece of paper upon with <u>every voter can write their own political message</u>." (The Age, 28.08.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Climate change exists, but is no problem

The sub-dimension **Climate change exists, but is not a problem** says that there is, for example, an increase in temperature or a drought, but it either does not assess these natural irregularities as consequences of "climate change" and "global warming" or accepted the consequences – either negative or positive ones – as not a problem/a positive aspect.

Example:

"With the threat of climate change, farmers' <u>ability to grow food in dry conditions could</u> <u>become a billion-dollar knowledge export industry</u>, according to a leading science writer." (The Age, 06.08.2007)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Climate change does not exist

The sub-dimension **Climate change does not exist** identifies the consequences but does not connect these consequences with "climate change" or "global warming". Thus, climate change is not a problem, and/or its existence is questioned.

Example:

"[Cardinal George] Pell, on the other hand, clings to the fashionable right-wing credo that <u>global warming is fraud</u>." (SMH, 19.03.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### 3.2.2 Causal interpretation (causes of climate change)

The aspect causal interpretation from Entman (1992) is divided into two parts. The frame dimension with the auxiliary "causes of climate change" concentrates on reasons why "Klimawandel"/"climate change" or "Erderwärmung"/"global warming" is an issue in today's public discourse and, thus, also in the media coverage. "Natural causes" is one frame sub-dimension of this frame dimension.

Select code 0 if the sub dimension is not mentioned in the article.

Select code 1 if the sub dimension appears in the selected coverage.

#### Sub dimension: Human activities (in general)

The sub-dimension **Human activities (in general)** shows that "climate change" and "global warming" are generally the result of human activities – they are anthropogenic.

Examples:

"In seinem kürzlich veröffentlichten Buch "Waking the Giant – How a Changing Climate Triggers Earthquakes, Tsunamis, and Volcanos" beschwört der Professor vom University College London ein Szenario herauf, in dem der <u>Mensch durch die ungebremste Emission von Treibhausgasen schlafende Monster aufweckt</u>." (FR, 04.07.2012)

"Der Raubbau an den Wäldern geht weiter, die Ozeane sind überfischt, die <u>Anzeichen</u> <u>für einen vom Menschen verursachten Klimawandel verstetigen sich</u>, die Artenvielfalt schwindet." (FAZ, 22.06.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Population increase

The sub-dimension **Population increase** sees world population growth and its consequences (i.e. the need for more meat) as responsible for "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"Its report, "Climate Change and Food Systems", estimated food production was responsible for between 19 and 29 per cent of mankind's total greenhouse emissions, far above UN estimates of 14 per cent based on a narrower definition of farming.... 'The world's agricultural systems face an uphill <u>struggle in feeding a projected nine to ten</u> <u>billion people by 2050</u>. <u>Climate change introduces a significant hurdle in this struggle</u>,' it said. The world population is now just above seven billion." (The Age, 31.10.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Denying that humans are a possible cause

The sub-dimension **Denying that humans are a possible cause** argues that the world is too big. So human beings are too small to be able to have an impact on "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"There may be an argument for Australia to price carbon, but it can't be to arrest global warming or slow climate change – we're simply too small an emitter of greenhouse gases for moderate cuts to make any measurable difference." (The Age, 12.04.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Destruction of forests

The sub-dimension **Destruction of forests** says that "climate change" and "global warming" is a result of a decreasing area of forests and tree population.

Example:

"Die Zeitungen des Landes sind voll mit Analysen und Berichten zu Klimawandel, den Folgen unkontrollierten Abholzens ganzer Wälder und dem prekären Gleichgewicht der Ökosysteme." (FAZ, 19.10.2009)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Emission of greenhouse gases

The sub-dimension **Emission of greenhouse gases** says that "climate change" and "global warming" are results of greenhouse gas emissions or an increasing amount of car and air traffic.

Example:

"Mark Dreyfus, parliamentary secretary for climate change and energy efficiency said, commercial buildings accounted for more than 10 per cent of national greenhouse gas emissions." (The Age, 23.02.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Natural causes

The sub-dimension **Natural causes** says that "climate change" and "global warming" is a consequence of natural cycles, such as solar activity or similar.

Example:

"But a group of physicists with strong links to the Republican White House cherry-picked one section of a Hansen graph and used it to misleadingly claim in Washington that it showed the <u>warming was solely due to the sun</u>." (The Age, 13.11.2009)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### 3.2.3 Causal interpretation (effects of climate change)

The second aspect of "causal interpretation" deals with the "effects of climate change". It asks the question: What are the consequences of climate change? Based on the foregone collection of sub-dimensions, four key aspects which are affected by climate change were chosen: nature, weather, humans, and the economy.

Select code 0 if the sub dimension is not mentioned in the article.

Select code 1 if the sub dimension appears in the selected coverage.

#### *Sub dimension: Effects on nature: changes in biodiversity – negative consequences*

The sub-dimension **Effects on nature: changes in biodiversity – negative consequences** refers to changes in animal and plant species based on "climate change" and "global warming". The changes are explicitly rated as negative.

Examples:

"Voters are alarmed about the loss of this nation's living heritage and the impact of burning forests on climate change will have to vote Green in 2007." (SMH, 24.07.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on nature: changes in biodiversity – positive consequences

The sub-dimension **Effects on nature: changes in biodiversity** – **positive consequences** refers to changes in animal and plant species based on "climate change" and "global warming". This change has a positive connotation, for example in terms of economic growth.

Example:

"Der Biologe arbeitet in Bad Zwischenahn im "Park der Gärten" und kann täglich beobachten, wie <u>die Erderwärmung Spuren hinterlässt: Kamelien trotzen plötzlich mit</u> <u>Leichtigkeit dem Winter, mediterrane Kräuter fühlen sich pudelwohl, und der Lotus</u> <u>öffnet seine Blüten.</u> Auch die Rhododendren haben ihren Rhythmus verändert." (FAZ, 17.06.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Effects on nature: sea-level rise

The sub-dimension **Effects on nature: sea-level rise** includes all causal effects of "climate change" and "global warming" regarding sea-level rise.

Examples:

"The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change <u>predicts a sea-level rise of up to 59</u> <u>centimetres over the next century</u>, a level that would inundate most of the Maldives' inhabited atolls." (SMH, 07.01.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Effects on nature: forest fires

The sub-dimension Effects on nature: forest fires includes all causal effects of "climate
change" and "global warming" regarding forest fires.

Examples:

"He was asked seven key questions, <u>including whether climate change was a contributing</u> <u>factor to the extreme fire-weather conditions on Black Saturday</u>, and how often such catastrophic conditions might occur over the next 10-40 years." (The Age, 14.08.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Effects on nature: erosions

The sub-dimension **Effects on nature: erosion** includes all causal effects of "climate change" and "global warming" regarding erosion.

Examples:

"Now there are warnings that <u>with climate change triggering higher seas</u> and fiercer, more frequent storms, we may soon <u>need to buffer Sydney's beaches from erosion by 'nourishing' them with sand mined from the sea floor." (SMH, 08.01.2008)</u>

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on nature: results of warming (floods, drought, ice melt etc.)

The sub-dimension Effects on nature: results of warming (floods, drought, ice melt etc.) includes issues such as floods, drought, ice melt etc. as a result of climate change.

Examples:

"Urban flooding is expected to become a bigger problem with climate change, with more intense rain events expected to occur more frequently, despite expectations of lower annual rainfall totals in many parts of Australia." (The Age, 15.01.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on weather: increase in temperature

The sub-dimension Effects on the weather: increase in temperature is the cause of heatwaves.

Example:

"Global warming of about 4.5 degrees was expected this century if emissions continued to rise at current levels, though warming could be as low as 3 degrees or as high as 7 degrees." (The Age, 17.08.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on weather: more extreme weather

The sub-dimension **Effects on the weather: more extreme weather** explains the view that "climate change" and "global warming" lead to an increase in extreme weather events.

Examples:

"Dr Rajendra Pachauri, the chairman of the United Nations' Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), said a new report on extreme weather events to be released later this year will support <u>previous findings natural disasters are increasing in frequency and</u> <u>intensity around the world.</u>" (SMH, 17.05.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on humans: diseases, epidemics, death etc.

The sub-dimension **Effects on humans: diseases, epidemics etc.** states that "climate change" and "global warming" could have negative effects on human health and can cause death.

Example:

"Professor McMichael's paper states that the greatest recurring health risk over past millennia <u>has been from food shortages, mostly caused by drying and drought</u>. <u>Warming also</u> <u>leads to an increase in infectious diseases</u> as a result of better growth conditions for bacteria and the proliferation of mosquitoes." (The Age, 31.01.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on humans: climate change refugees/suffering of the poor

The sub-dimension **Effects on humans: climate change refugees/suffering of the poor** show that "climate change" and "global warming" causes people to flee due to drought, floods or similar environmental disasters.

Example:

"The President of what could be the first country in the world lost <u>to climate change has</u> <u>urged Australia to prepare for a mass wave of climate refugees seeking a new place to</u> <u>live</u>. The Maldivian President, Mohamed Nasheed, said his government was considering Australia as a possible new home if the tiny archipelago disappears beneath rising seas." (SMH, 07.01.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on humans: future generations will be climate change victims

The sub-dimension **Effects on humans: future generations will be climate change victims** identifies future generations as victims of the effects of "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"The time for doubt has passed', Mr Ban told the meeting of 150 nations he had convened in New York on Monday, the biggest conference on <u>climate change</u> yet. 'What we do about it will define us, our era, and ultimately <u>the global legacy</u>, we leave for future generations."" (SMH, 26.09.2007)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on humans: water/food supply

The sub-dimension **Effects on humans: water/food supply** shows that climate change has negative consequences on water as well as food supply and, thus, could result in famine-hit countries.

Example:

"The Cities as Water Supply Catchments research programme at Monash University is looking at alternative water systems to counter pressure such as drought, population growth and <u>climate change</u>, which are threatening traditional water supplies' ability to <u>meet urban needs.</u>" (SMH, 12.10.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on economy: huge negative effects if we do nothing, less negative effects if we fight climate change

The sub-dimension **Effects on the economy: huge negative effects if we do nothing, less negative effects if we combat climate change** says that the economy has advantages from tackling "climate change" as well as "global warming".

Example:

"Zu diesem Schluss kommt auch Claudia Kemfert, die für das Deutsche Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung DIW eine Abschätzung vorgelegt hat: <u>Bis zu 800 Milliarden Euro muss</u> <u>Deutschland demnach bis 2050 für die Folgen eines ungebremsten Klimawandels einpla-</u> <u>nen. Um das Zwei-Prozent-Ziel einzuhalten, wären nur 500 Milliarden Euro fällig</u>. Für die Bundesrepublik fallen die Kosten eher moderat aus, weil Mitteleuropa vom Klimawandel weitaus weniger betroffen sein wird als der Süden des Kontinents und Afrika." (SZ, 17.05.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on economy: economical benefits

The sub-dimension **Effects on the economy: economic benefits** states that "climate change" as well as "global warming" have economic benefits.

#### Examples:

"Gillard, in her Adelaide speech, took on the employment fears. She argued that failure to act on climate would cost jobs, through <u>climate change</u> itself and because <u>Aus-</u> <u>tralia would become less competitive in a lower carbon world. But if we acted, jobs</u> <u>would be created in cleaner energy</u>, while the nature of other jobs would be transformed." (The Age, 18.03.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Effects on economy: economic problems including costs

The sub-dimension **Effects on the economy: economic problems including costs** means that "climate change" as well as "global warming" causes economic problems and it costs money.

Example:

"Nach den Berechnungen der Umweltökonomin könnte der <u>Klimawandel in den</u> <u>kommenden 50 Jahren durchschnittlich zu gesamtwirtschaftlichen</u> <u>Wachstumseinbußen von 0,5 Prozentpunkten pro Jahr führen.</u>" (SZ, 17.05.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### 3.2.4 Responsibility

Entman's (1993) frame dimension "moral evaluation" is renamed "*responsibility*" because most of the literature found about framing connects this frame dimension to "responsibility" (as discussed in Chapter 3). In this frame dimension, the coverage included a statement about the "responsibility" for "Klimawandel"/"climate change" or "Erderwärmung"/"global warming", ranging from "Everybody is responsible" to "Everybody is discharged from responsibility".

Select code 0 if the sub dimension is not mentioned in the article.

Select code 1 if the sub dimension appears in the selected coverage.

#### Sub dimension: Everybody is responsible

The sub-dimension **Everybody is responsible** means that all human beings and their activities are responsible for "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"The federal Environment Minister, Malcolm Turnbull, goes tow-to-toe in a debate on <u>climate change</u> with a 15-year-old. Turnbull is part of a discussion panel that includes a <u>Baulkham Hills year 9 student</u>, Alastair Wadlow, who set up Planet Patrol with his sisters <u>Imogen and Freya to encourage children to care for the planet</u>." (SZ, 13.12.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Everybody is discharged from responsibility

The sub-dimension **Everybody is discharged from responsibility** means that neither human beings nor their activities are responsible for "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"The federal Environment Minister, Malcolm Turnbull, goes tow-to-toe in a debate on <u>climate change</u> with a 15-year-old. Turnbull is part of a discussion panel that includes a <u>Baulkham Hills year 9 student, Alastair Wadlow, who set up Planet Patrol with his sisters</u> <u>Imogen and Freya to encourage children to care for the planet.</u>" (SMH, 13.12.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

Sub dimension: Humans have moral deficits

The sub-dimension **Humans have moral deficits** says that human beings in industrial countries are responsible for "climate change" and "global warming" whereas developing countries have to deal with the consequences.

Examples:

"A poll by the Lowy Institute has tracked the willingness of Australians to pay extra for electricity. <u>The number of people who refused to pay anything to tackle climate change has increased from 21 per cent in 2008 to 35 per cent in 2010</u>." (The Age, 05.09.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Financial/economic aspects should not influence activities combating climate change

The sub-dimension **Financial/economic aspects should not influence activities combating climate change** shows that subsidies in monetary form should not play a role in the context of "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"It wasn't the science, the scientists, or the economics that <u>killed action on climate</u> <u>change</u>,' he wrote. <u>'What was it? The answer is, the usual suspects: greed and cowardice</u>. If you want to <u>understand opposition to climate action follow the money</u>." (The Age, 13.11.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Developed countries are responsible

The sub-dimension **Developed countries are responsible** says that developed countries are mainly responsible for the increasing problems of "climate change" and "global warm-ing".

Example:

"Chinese Finance Minister Jin Renqing said his country supported the use of market-based emissions trading as a method of controlling climate change but <u>emphasised that China</u> expected developed nations to carry the burden. 'Greenhouse gas is a serious challenge for us, but the source of most of the greenhouse gas produced came from developed countries,' he said." (The Age, 04.08.2007)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### 3.2.5 Treatment recommendation

"Treatment recommendation" has two major tasks: First, it demands action. The readers of the coverage are asked to be active in the context of "Klimawandel"/"climate change" or "Erderwärmung"/"global warming". Second, it offers excuses for no activity. This could be, for example, the fact, that "the economy comes first" or that "there is no problem". Then, no treatment is required.

Select code 0 if the sub dimension is not mentioned in the article.

Select code 1 if the sub dimension appears in the selected coverage.

#### Sub dimension: Something must be done, in general

The sub-dimension **Something must be done, in general** does not name specific activities, but says that something must be done in the context "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"<u>Climate change is one of the single biggest challenges</u> facing development, and <u>we need</u> to assume the moral responsibility to take action on behalf of future generations, especially the poorest." (The Age, 19.11.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: General reduction of greenhouse gases – national focus

The sub-dimension **General reduction of greenhouse gases – national focus** asks human beings for action to reduce the amount of greenhouse gases in their own country.

Example:

"As gas target would be a logical next step for the <u>Brumby government</u> – given the bold commitments <u>it has already made on other fronts to tackle greenhouse emissions in its</u> white paper on climate change." (The Age, 04.10.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: General reduction of greenhouse gases – international focus

The sub-dimension **General reduction of greenhouse gases – international focus** asks human beings for action to reduce the amount of greenhouse gases throughout the world.

Example:

"Bis zum Jahr 2050 müssten <u>die Indstrieländer ihren Ausstoß an Treibhaugasen um 80 bis</u> <u>90 Prozent</u> verringern; nur dann könne ein <u>Klimawandel mit dramatischen Folgen</u> <u>verhindert</u> werden." (FAZ, 15.12.2009)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Demand climate change policy – national focus

The sub-dimension **Demand climate change policy** – **national focus** discusses the invention of special policies regarding "climate change" and "global warming" on a national basis.

Example:

"Promised before the 2006 election, the climate change white paper has been delayed amid internal confusion while the state government waited on the design of a national carbon trading scheme." (The Age, 16.07.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Demand climate change policy – international focus

The sub-dimension **Demand climate change policy** – **international focus** discusses the invention of special policies regarding "climate change" and "global warming" on an international basis.

Examples:

"Using a simple analogy, he said that although he did not expect his home to burn down, he had taken out insurance against such a disaster. In the same way, Australia and the world need an insurance policy for climate change." (The Age, 20.06.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

Sub dimension: Demand more responsibility by the government/politicians

The sub-dimension **Demand more responsibility by the government/politicians** demands action from the government as well as from ministers and other politicians in terms of climate change.

Example:

"Speaking in Canberra, the [Climate] institute's Erwin Jackson said he hoped a hung parliament that gave influence to the Greens and the independents could ensure more 'accountability' in climate change policy." (The Age, 25.08.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Replacing/displacing one energy source with another

The sub-dimension **Replacing/displacing one energy source with another** discusses for example whether the use of fossil fuels for energy consumption could be replaced by the use of nuclear power plants for generating energy.

Example:

"The growing realisation that the challenge of combating <u>global climate change will en-</u> <u>tail significant and substantive shifts in energy production</u> and use in the developed world has <u>stimulated a resurgence of reactor building and planning worldwide</u>", he said." (SMH, 02.02.2008)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Rewarding climate friendly behaviour

The sub-dimension **Rewarding climate-friendly behaviour** says that the inhabitants must be recompensed for behaving in a climate-friendly way.

Example:

"Business customers can also <u>take advantage of the offer</u> [to switch from electric to solar hot water or heat pumps], which is a combination of <u>certificates</u>, a discount from the man-<u>ufacturer</u>, and <u>funding from an NSW State Government climate change fund</u>." (SMH, 31.07.2007)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Something has to be done, but should not influence economic growth

The sub-dimension **Something must be done but this should not influence economic growth** supports all activities in the context of "climate change" and "global warming" which do not influence economic growth.

Example:

"Far from spending the next three years chatting about <u>whether to get serious about com-</u> <u>bating climate change, we need to debate our unquestioned commitment to unlimited eco-</u> <u>nomic growth</u>." (SMH, 14.07.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Economic aspects must be changed because of climate change/global warming (including greenwashing)

The sub-dimension Economic aspects must be changed because of climate change/global warming (including greenwashing) says that, for example, a new infrastructure is an investment in tackling climate change/global warming. It also discusses aspects which show that an institution or company just wants to "green" its image.

Example:

"In Deutschland sieht es so aus, als habe zumindest Bundesumweltminister Sigmar Gabriel erkannt, wie sinnlos und abwegig der ewige Konflikt zwischen Ökonomie und Umweltschutz geworden ist. Es gilt in der Tat, <u>nun entschiedener die Effizienz- und Einsparpotentiale in der Energienutzung auszuschöpfen, anders haben Sonne, Wind und andere erneuerbare Ressourcen so schnell keine Chance, mehr als ein Nischendasein zu führen. Und es gilt, diesen "Leitmarkt Energietechnik" mit aller Kraft sowohl für die heimischen Klimaschutzziele als auch für den Export zu nutzen." (SZ, 28.11.2008)</u>

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Nuclear energy helps to reduce emissions/fossil fuel quarrying

The sub-dimension **Nuclear energy helps to reduce emissions/fossil fuel quarrying** states that nuclear energy is a clean alternative to fossil fuels and/or helps to reduce carbon emissions.

Example:

"<u>Nuclear energy produces no carbon dioxide emissions</u> when operating." (SMH, 27.11.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Use of renewable energy

The sub-dimension **Use of renewable energy** invites human beings to use renewable energy sources, such as wind, sun or water.

Example:

"Greenpeace, and many other environment groups, argue that the process cannot deliver emissions cuts in time to slow down <u>human-created global warming</u>, and that public investment in the experimental technology diverts resources from <u>other ways of reducing</u> <u>emissions</u>, such as energy efficiency, solar, wind and wave power." (SMH, 06.05.2008)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Reduction of using fossil fuels

The sub-dimension **Reduction of using fossil fuels** wants human beings to reduce the consumption of fossil fuels.

Example:

"Both <u>climate change</u> and peak oil force us to think about different kinds of cities that are <u>able to cope with less fossil fuels</u>,' he says. '<u>We've built our civilisation around the</u> <u>cheapness and easy available fossil fuels</u>. That era is ending." (The Age, 19.09.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

Sub dimension: Rebuilding the natural environment

The sub-dimension **Rebuilding the natural environment** explains the importance of a healthy natural environment and shows that activities are necessary to help nature to recover. This sub-dimension is about a fundamental change.

Example:

"The cheapest and most efficient way of slowing down <u>global warming is to protect and</u> <u>restore the forests</u>, particularly the tropical forests,' the 77-year-old said." (The Age, 10.06.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Take measures to mitigate the effects of climate change

The sub-dimension **Take measures to mitigate the effects of climate change** is about establishing a risk management in the context of environmental disasters.

Examples:

"<u>Versicherungslösungen wollen Munich Re und andere im Rahmen der MCII auch für all</u> jene kreieren, die vom Klimawandel besonders betroffen sein werden: die Entwicklungsländer, die in den Dürre- oder Hochwasserzonen Afrikas und Asiens liegen." (SZ, 27.11.2009)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Tips for preventing the effects of climate change

The sub-dimension **Tips for preventing the effects of climate change** is about practical hints which show the reader how he/she could help to tackle climate change and global warming.

Example:

"However, to <u>achieve the large reductions in climate change pollution</u> below 1990 levels being called for by scientists, Australia would <u>also need to cut its immigration intake and</u> <u>end land clearing</u>, the report said." (SMH, 10.10.2007)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Increase in knowledge about climate change/global warming

The sub-dimension **Increase in knowledge about climate change/global warming** includes articles which demand climate change education or which have educational content that increases readers' knowledge about "climate change" and "global warming".

Examples:

"Tackling the challenges of <u>climate change will require us all to understand</u> not just the science of climate change but also what options we have to respond to it and mitigate further change. ...We must be clear about what is happening now, and that <u>information</u> <u>must be available to everyone</u>." (The Age, 13.07.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

### Sub dimension: Scientific development

The sub-dimension **Scientific development** makes "climate change" and "global warming" a matter of scientific development. Articles in this sub-dimension say that scientists are invited to find or work on solutions for the consequences/challenges of "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"The Prime Minister used the occasion to announce a new <u>climate change fund</u> – to be set up in 2011, to <u>pay for research into clean energy</u>, and also to help subsidise the power bills of the less well-off." (Sydney Morning Herald, 23.10.2007)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

#### Sub dimension: Smaller personal carbon footprint

The sub-dimension **Smaller personal carbon footprint** asks human beings to reduce their personal expenditure of energy.

Example:

"Jeder Deutsche hat im vergangenen Jahr zwar noch 7,5 Tonnen umweltschädlichen Kohlenstoffdioxids (CO<sub>2</sub>) freigesetzt. Damit leiteten die Deutschen jedoch eine Trendwende ein. Denn vor zehn Jahren waren es noch 8,0 Tonnen." (SZ, 13.12.2010)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: Ask (the media) to stop publishing climate-change-sceptic positions

The sub-dimension **Ask (the media) to stop publishing climate-change-sceptical positions** argues that the climate-change-sceptical position, which is often picked up and published by the media for reasons of balance, but is also published as a public relations exercise by climate-change-sceptical scientists or institutions, and should be stopped.

Example:

"The existence of dissenting voices is a mark of democracy, but this does not mean that <u>balance in reporting scientific and policy debates is achieved by giving opposing sides</u> equal weight when that 'balance' does not remotely resemble the weight of scientific support for human-caused climate change." (The Age, 29.03.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: No treatment required: the economy comes first

The sub-dimension **No treatment required: the economy comes first** claims that economic activities are more important than any activities combating "climate change" and "global warming".

Example:

"<u>Diese Länder [Schwellenländer] wollen von ihren Wachstumskonzepten nicht abrücken</u>. Internationale [Klima]\_Abmachungen, die sie in ihrer Entwicklung beschränken könnten, lehnen sie ab." (FAZ, 22.06.2012)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	А	В	С

Sub dimension: No treatment required: there is no problem

The sub-dimension **No treatment required: there is not a problem** ignores all the problems of "climate change" and "global warming" and does not ask for any activities.

Example:

"Fact 1. A mild warming about 0.5 degrees Celsius (well within previous natural temperature variations) occurred between 1979 and 1998 and has been followed by slight global cooling over the past 10 years. Ergo, <u>dangerous global warming is not occurring</u>." (The Age, 27.06.2011)

0	Not mentioned				
1	Is mentioned	by key player	A	В	С

# Appendix B: Reliability Test

Artikel	Problem Defi- nition/ 1. Coding	Problem Defi- nition/ 2. Coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ correct coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ wrong coding				
Süddeutsche Zeitung	Süddeutsche Zeitung							
Der Kuckuck	1	1	1	0				
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	1	1	1	0				
Stimme der Unterneh- mer	1	1	0	1				
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	1	1	1	0				
In der Klimakrise	1	1	1	0				
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0				
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	1	1	1	0				
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	1	1	1	0				
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	1	1	1	0				
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	1	1	1	0				

# **Reliability Test/Frame Dimension "Problem Definition"**

Untergehen wird teuer	1	1	1	0
Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	1	1	1	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	1	1	1	0
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	1	1	1	0
Wenn Ökologie und Öko- nomie sich finden	1	1	1	0
Obamas Versuch	1	1	1	0
Vor uns die Flut	1	1	1	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	1	1	1	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	1	1	1	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	1	1	1	0
Frankfurter Allgemein	e Zeitung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	1	1	1	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	1	1	1	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	1	1	1	0

Zur Kenntnis genommen, 21.12.2009	1	1	1	0
Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne- marks	1	1	1	0
Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	1	1	1	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	1	1	1	0
Gletscher bluten	1	1	1	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	1	1	1	0
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	1	1	1	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	1	1	1	0
Autoritäres Klima	1	1	1	0
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	1	1	1	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	1	1	1	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	1	1	1	0
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	1	1	1	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	1	1	1	0

Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	1	1	1	0
Ein Felssturz nach Ver- witterung	1	1	1	0
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0
Sydney Morning Herald				
A tectonic jolt might be enough	1	1	1	0
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	1	1	1	0
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	1	1	1	0
Bali: at least the world is talking	1	1	1	0
As the ice melts, Aus- tralia confronts the cold, hard facts	1	1	1	0
Other cities sign up to turn off	1	1	1	0
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	1	1	0	1
Faith in business plum- mets	1	1	1	0
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	1	1	1	0
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	1	1	1	0

Out with fossil fuel subsi- dies and in with a carbon tax	1	1	1	0
Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	1	1	1	0
Slow progress on clean coal projects	1	1	1	0
Column 8, 02.10.2011	1	1	1	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	1	1	1	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	1	1	1	0
No doubt about it, the fu- ture is still up in the air	1	1	1	0
No, you're not dreaming, it's a white Christmas	1	1	1	0
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	1	1	1	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	1	1	1	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	1	1	1	0
Local niche for drought expertise	1	1	1	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	1	1	1	0

Don't panic, power is not too far away	1	1	1	0
Melding sustainability and design	1	1	1	0
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	1	1	1	0
You're a pack of weather wimps	1	1	1	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	1	1	1	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong investment returns	1	1	1	0
Can't talk busy, busy	1	1	1	0
Climate change needs a plain English guide	1	1	1	0
Life under Gillard could be an expensive business	1	1	1	0
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	1	1	1	0
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	1	1	1	0
The ideology of endless growth	1	1	1	0
In praise of stimulus	1	1	1	0
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	1	1	1	0

Secrets behind weird sci- ence	1	1	1	0
Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	1	1	1	0
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	1	1	1	0
Sum			78	2
Coefficient				0.98

Artikel	Causal Inter- pretation (causes of cli- mate change)/ 1. Coding	Causal Inter- pretation (causes of cli- mate change)/ 2. Coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ correct coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ wrong coding
Süddeutsche Zeitung				
Der Kuckuck	0	0	0	0
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	0	0	0	0
Stimme der Unterneh- mer	1	1	1	0
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	0	0	0	0
In der Klimakrise	0	0	0	0
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	0	0	0	0
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	0	0	0	0
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	0	0	0	0
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	0	0	0	0
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	0	0	0	0
Untergehen wird teuer	0	0	0	0

Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	0	0	0	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	0	0	0	0
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	0	0	0	0
Wenn Ökologie und Öko- nomie sich finden	1	1	1	0
Obamas Versuch	0	0	0	0
Vor uns die Flut	0	0	0	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	1	1	1	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	0	0	0	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	0	0	0	0
Frankfurter Allgemeine Ze	itung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	0	0	0	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	0	0	0	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	1	1	1	0
Zur Kenntnis genommen, 21.12.2009	0	0	0	0

Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne- marks	0	0	0	0
Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	0	0	0	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	0	0	0	0
Gletscher bluten	0	0	0	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	0	0	0	0
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	0	0	0	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	0	0	0	0
Autoritäres Klima	0	0	0	0
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	0	0	0	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	0	0	0	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	0	0	0	0
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	0	0	0	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	1	1	1	0
Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	1	1	1	0

Ein Felssturz nach Ver- witterung	0	0	0	0
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	0	0	0	0
Sydney Morning Herald				
A tectonic jolt might be enough	1	1	1	0
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	0	0	0	0
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	0	0	0	0
Bali: at least the world is talking	0	0	0	0
As the ice melts, Aus- tralia confronts the cold, hard facts	0	0	0	0
Other cities sign up to turn off	0	0	0	0
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	0	0	0	0
Faith in business plum- mets	0	0	0	0
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	0	0	0	0
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	1	1	1	0
Out with fossil fuel subsi- dies and in with a carbon tax	0	0	0	0

Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	0	0	0	0
Slow progress on clean coal projects	0	0	0	0
Column 8, 02.10.2011	0	0	0	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	0	0	0	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	1	1	1	0
No doubt about it, the future is still up in the air	2	2	1	1
No, you're not dreaming, it's a white Christmas	0	0	0	0
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	0	0	0	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	0	0	0	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	0	0	0	0
Local niche for drought expertise	0	0	0	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	0	0	0	0
Don't panic, power is not too far away	0	0	0	0

Melding sustainability and design	0	0	0	0
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	0	0	0	0
You're a pack of weather wimps	1	1	1	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	0	0	0	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong invest- ment returns	0	0	0	0
Can't talk busy, busy	0	0	0	0
Climate change needs a plain English guide	1	1	1	0
Life under Gillard could be an expensive business	0	0	0	0
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	0	0	0	0
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	0	0	0	0
The ideology of endless growth	0	0	0	0
In praise of stimulus	0	0	0	0
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	0	0	0	0
Secrets behind weird sci- ence	2	2	2	0

Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	0	0	0	0
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	0	0	0	1
Summe	15			2
Coefficient				0.87

Artikel	tation (effects of climate change)/		Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ correct coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ wrong coding		
Süddeutsche Zeitung						
Der Kuckuck	0	0	0	0		
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	1	1	1	0		
Stimme der Unterneh- mer	0	0	0	0		
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	1	1	1	0		
In der Klimakrise	1	1	1	0		
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0		
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	1	1	1	0		
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	0	0	0	0		
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	0	0	0	0		
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	0	0	0	0		
Untergehen wird teuer	0	0	0	0		

## Reliability Test/Frame Dimension "Causal Interpretation (effects of climate change)"

Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	1	1	1	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	0	0	0	0
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	0	0	0	0
Wenn Ökologie und Ökonomie sich finden	0	0	0	0
Obamas Versuch	0	0	0	0
Vor uns die Flut	1	1	1	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	0	0	0	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	0	0	0	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	1	1	0	1
Frankfurter Allgemeine Z	eitung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	1	1	1	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	1	1	1	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	0	0	0	0
Zur Kenntnis genom- men, 21.12.2009	1	1	1	0

Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne- marks	0	0	0	0
Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	0	0	0	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	1	0	0	1
Gletscher bluten	1	1	1	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	0	0	0	0
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	1	1	1	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	0	0	0	0
Autoritäres Klima	0	0	0	0
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	0	0	0	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	0	0	0	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	0	0	0	0
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	0	0	0	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	0	0	0	0
Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	1	1	1	0

Ein Felssturz nach Ver- witterung	1	1	1	0		
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	0	0	0	0		
Sydney Morning Herald						
A tectonic jolt might be enough	0	0	0	0		
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	1	1	1	0		
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	0	0	0	0		
Bali: at least the world is talking	0	0	0	0		
As the ice melts, Aus- tralia confronts the cold, hard facts	1	2	1	1		
Other cities sign up to turn off	0	0	0	0		
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	0	0	0	0		
Faith in business plum- mets	0	0	0	0		
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	1	1	1	0		
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	0	0	0	0		
Out with fossil fuel sub- sidies and in with a car- bon tax	0	0	0	0		

Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	0	0	0	0
Slow progress on clean coal projects	1	0	0	1
Column 8, 02.10.2011	1	1	1	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	0	0	0	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	1	1	1	0
No doubt about it, the future is still up in the air	0	0	0	0
No, you're not dream- ing, it's a white Christ- mas	1	1	1	0
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	2	2	2	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	0	0	0	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	0	0	0	0
Local niche for drought expertise	1	1	1	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	0	0	0	0
Don't panic, power is not too far away	1	1	1	0

Melding sustainability and design	0	0	0	0
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	1	1	1	0
You're a pack of weather wimps	0	0	0	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	1	1	1	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong in- vestment returns	0	0	0	0
Can't talk busy, busy	0	0	0	0
Climate change needs a plain English guide	2	1	1	1
Life under Gillard could be an expensive busi- ness	0	0	0	0
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	0	0	0	0
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	0	0	0	0
The idiocy of endless growth	1	1	0	1
In praise of stimulus	1	2	1	1
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	0	0	0	0
Secrets behind weird sci- ence	0	0	0	0

Coefficient	0.80			
Summe	35		10	8
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	1	1	1	0
Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	1	1	0	1

## Reliability Test/Frame Dimension "Responsibility"

Artikel	Responsibi- lity/ 1. Coding	Responsibi- lity/ 2. Coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ correct coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ wrong coding		
Süddeutsche Zeitung						
Der Kuckuck	0	0	0	0		
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	0	0	0	0		
Stimme der Unterneh- mer	0	0	0	0		
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	0	0	0	0		
In der Klimakrise	0	0	0	0		
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	0	0	0	0		
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	0	0	0	0		
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	1	1	1	0		
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	0	0	0	0		
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	0	0	0	0		
Untergehen wird teuer	0	0	0	0		

Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	0	0	0	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	1	1	1	0
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	0	0	0	0
Wenn Ökologie und Öko- nomie sich finden	0	0	0	0
Obamas Versuch	0	0	0	0
Vor uns die Flut	0	0	0	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	0	0	0	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	0	0	0	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	0	0	0	0
Frankfurter Allgemeine Ze	eitung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	0	0	0	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	0	0	0	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	0	0	0	0
Zur Kenntnis genommen, 21.12.2009	1	1	1	0

Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne-	0	0	0	0
marks Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	0	0	0	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	0	0	0	0
Gletscher bluten	0	0	0	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	0	0	0	0
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	0	0	0	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	0	0	0	0
Autoritäres Klima	0	0	0	0
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	0	0	0	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	0	0	0	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	0	1	0	1
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	0	0	0	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	0	0	0	0
Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	0	0	0	0

Ein Felssturz nach Ver- witterung	0	0	0	0
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	0	0	0	0
Sydney Morning Herald				
A tectonic jolt might be enough	0	0	0	0
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	0	0	0	0
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	0	0	0	0
Bali: at least the world is talking	0	0	0	0
As the ice melts, Aus- tralia confronts the cold, hard facts	0	0	0	0
Other cities sign up to turn off	0	0	0	0
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	0	0	0	0
Faith in business plum- mets	0	0	0	0
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	0	0	0	0
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	0	0	0	0
Out with fossil fuel subsi- dies and in with a carbon tax	0	0	0	0

Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	0	0	0	0
Slow progress on clean coal projects	0	0	0	0
Column 8, 02.10.2011	0	0	0	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	0	0	0	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	0	0	0	0
No doubt about it, the future is still up in the air	0	0	0	0
No, you're not dreaming, it's a white Christmas	0	0	0	0
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	0	0	0	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	0	0	0	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	0	1	0	1
Local niche for drought expertise	0	0	0	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	0	0	0	0
Don't panic, power is not too far away	0	0	0	0

Melding sustainability and design	0	0	0	0
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	0	0	0	0
You're a pack of weather wimps	0	0	0	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	0	0	0	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong invest- ment returns	0	0	0	0
Can't talk busy, busy	0	0	0	0
Climate change needs a plain English guide	0	0	0	0
Life under Gillard could be an expensive business	1	1	0	1
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	1	1	1	0
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	0	0	0	0
The ideology of endless growth	0	0	0	0
In praise of stimulus	0	0	0	0
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	0	0	0	0
Secrets behind weird sci- ence	0	0	0	0

Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	0	0	0	0
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	0	0	0	0
Summe	5			3
Coefficient				0.40

Artikel	Treatment recommen- dation/ 1. Coding	Treatment recommen- dation/ 2. Coding	Number of sub frame di- mensions/ correct coding	Number of sub frame dimensions/ wrong coding
Süddeutsche Zeitung				
Der Kuckuck	0	0	0	0
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	0	0	0	0
Stimme der Unternehmer	0	0	0	0
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	1	2	1	1
In der Klimakrise	0	0	0	0
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	0	0	0	0
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	0	0	0	0
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	1	1	1	0
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	1	1	0	1
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	1	1	1	0
Untergehen wird teuer	1	1	1	0

**Reliability Test/Frame Dimension "Treatment recommendation"** 

Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	0	0	0	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	0	0	0	0
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	0	0	0	0
Wenn Ökologie und Öko- nomie sich finden	0	0	0	0
Obamas Versuch	0	0	0	0
Vor uns die Flut	0	0	0	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	0	0	0	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	1	1	1	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	0	0	0	0
Frankfurter Allgemeine Zei	tung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	0	0	0	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	0	0	0	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	0	0	0	0
Zur Kenntnis genommen, 21.12.2009	0	0	0	0

Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne- marks	1	1	0	1
Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	1	1	1	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	0	0	0	0
Gletscher bluten	0	0	0	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	0	1	0	1
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	0	0	0	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	1	1	1	0
Autoritäres Klima	0	0	0	0
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	1	1	1	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	0	0	0	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	0	0	0	0
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	1	1	1	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	1	1	1	0
Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	0	0	0	0

Ein Felssturz nach Verwit- terung	0	0	0	0
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0
Sydney Morning Herald				
A tectonic jolt might be enough	0	0	0	0
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	0	0	0	0
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	0	0	0	0
Bali: at least the world is talking	1	1	1	0
As the ice melts, Australia confronts the cold, hard facts	1	1	1	0
Other cities sign up to turn off	0	1	0	1
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	1	1	1	0
Faith in business plum- mets	1	1	0	1
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	0	0	0	0
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	1	1	1	0
Out with fossil fuel subsi- dies and in with a carbon tax	1	1	1	0

Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	3	3	2	1
Slow progress on clean coal projects	1	1	1	0
Column 8, 02.10.2011	0	0	0	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	1	1	1	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	0	0	0	0
No doubt about it, the fu- ture is still up in the air	0	0	0	0
No, you're not dreaming, it's a white Christmas	0	0	0	0
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	0	0	0	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	1	1	1	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	1	1	0	1
Local niche for drought expertise	0	0	0	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	1	1	1	0
Don't panic, power is not too far away	0	0	0	0

Melding sustainability and design	1	1	1	0
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	0	0	0	0
You're a pack of weather wimps	0	0	0	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	0	0	0	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong investment returns	1	1	1	0
Can't talk busy, busy	1	2	1	1
Climate change needs a plain English guide	1	1	1	0
Life under Gillard could be an expensive business	2	2	2	0
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	0	0	0	0
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	1	1	1	0
The ideology of endless growth	0	0	0	0
In praise of stimulus	0	0	0	0
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	0	0	0	0
Secrets behind weird sci- ence	0	0	0	0

			0.74	
Summe	35			9
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	1	1	1	0
Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	0	0	0	0

## **Reliability test/actors**

Artikel	Actors/ 1. Coding	Actors/ 2. Coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ correct coding	Number of sub frame dimen- sions/ wrong coding
Süddeutsche Zeitung				
Der Kuckuck	1	1	0	1
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	1	1	1	0
Stimme der Unterneh- mer	1	1	1	0
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	2	2	2	0
In der Klimakrise	1	1	1	0
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	1	1	1	0
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	1	1	1	0
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	1	1	1	0
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	1	1	1	0
Untergehen wird teuer	1	1	1	0

Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	1	1	1	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	1	1	0	1
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	1	1	1	0
Wenn Ökologie und Öko- nomie sich finden	1	1	1	0
Obamas Versuch	1	1	1	0
Vor uns die Flut	1	1	1	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	1	1	1	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	1	1	1	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	1	1	1	0
Frankfurter Allgemeine Ze	itung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	1	1	1	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	1	1	1	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	1	1	0	1
Zur Kenntnis genommen, 21.12.2009	1	1	1	0

Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne- marks	1	1	0	1
Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	1	1	1	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	1	1	1	0
Gletscher bluten	1	1	1	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	1	1	0	1
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	1	1	1	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	1	1	1	0
Autoritäres Klima	1	1	1	0
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	1	1	1	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	1	1	1	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	1	1	1	0
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	1	1	1	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	1	1	1	0

Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	1	1	1	0
Ein Felssturz nach Ver- witterung	1	1	1	0
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0
Sydney Morning Herald				
A tectonic jolt might be enough	1	1	1	0
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	1	1	1	0
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	1	1	1	0
Bali: at least the world is talking	1	1	1	0
As the ice melts, Aus- tralia confronts the cold, hard facts	2	1	1	1
Other cities sign up to turn off	1	1	1	0
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	1	1	1	0
Faith in business plum- mets	1	1	0	1
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	1	1	1	0
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	1	1	1	0

Out with fossil fuel subsi- dies and in with a carbon tax	1	1	1	0
Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	1	1	0	1
Slow progress on clean coal projects	1	1	1	0
Column 8, 02.10.2011	2	2	2	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	1	1	1	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	1	1	1	0
No doubt about it, the future is still up in the air	1	1	1	0
No, you're not dreaming, it's a white Christmas	1	1	1	0
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	1	1	1	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	1	1	1	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	1	1	1	0
Local niche for drought expertise	1	1	1	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	1	1	1	0

Don't panic, power is not too far away	1	1	1	0
Melding sustainability and design	1	1	0	1
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	1	1	0	1
You're a pack of weather wimps	1	1	1	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	1	1	1	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong investment returns	1	1	1	0
Can't talk busy, busy	1	1	1	0
Climate change needs a plain English guide	1	1	1	0
Life under Gillard could be an expensive business	3	3	3	0
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	1	1	1	0
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	1	2	1	1
The ideology of endless growth	1	1	1	0
In praise of stimulus	1	1	0	1

Coefficient				0.87
Summe			74	11
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	1	1	0	1
Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	1	1	1	0
Secrets behind weird sci- ence	2	2	2	0
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	1	1	1	0

## Reliability test/form of expression

Artikel	Form of ex- pression/ 1. Coding	Form of ex- pression/ 2. Coding	Number of sub frame di- mensions/ correct cod- ing	Number of sub frame dimensions/ wrong coding
Süddeutsche Zeitung				
Der Kuckuck	1	1	1	0
Imker fürchten Pestizide und Agro-Gentechnik	1	1	1	0
Stimme der Unternehmer	1	1	1	0
An den Grenzen des Un- bekannten	1	1	1	0
In der Klimakrise	1	1	1	0
Europa kneift beim Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0
Eiskalte Erderwärmung	1	1	1	0
Experten für Welt- klimaabkommen	1	1	1	0
Blick in die Presse, 30.09.2009	1	1	0	1
Trübe Sicht vom Gipfel	1	1	1	0
Untergehen wird teuer	1	1	1	0

Lord Stern appelliert an die EU	1	1	1	0
Wo Wüsten Hokuspokus sind	1	1	1	0
Die globale Moral der Hilfe	1	1	1	0
Wenn Ökologie und Öko- nomie sich finden	1	1	0	1
Obamas Versuch	1	1	1	0
Vor uns die Flut	1	1	1	0
Bio allein reicht nicht	1	1	1	0
Konsequenter Rücktritt	1	1	1	0
Projekte mit Pioniergeist	1	1	1	0
Frankfurter Allgemeine Zei	tung			
Der lange Weg von Bonn nach Kopenhagen	1	1	1	0
Wassermangel in Asien könnte zu Unruhen füh- ren	1	1	1	0
Ohne Wald kein Wasser	1	1	0	1
Zur Kenntnis genommen, 21.12.2009	1	1	1	0

Größte Demonstration in der Geschichte Däne- marks	1	1	1	0
Debatten-Gipfel in L'Aq- uila	1	1	1	0
Das ist des Pfirsichs Kern	1	1	1	0
Gletscher bluten	1	1	1	0
Ein nicht ganz ernst ge- meinter Ausblick	1	1	1	0
IWF streitet über einen "Grünen Fonds"	1	1	1	0
Technik für eine klima- freundliche Welt	1	1	1	0
Autoritäres Klima	1	1	0	1
Gegen nationale Klima- ziele	1	1	1	0
Ein Desaster in Zeitlupe	1	1	1	0
180 Stunden für den Kli- maschutz	1	1	1	0
Frankreich will Devisen- steuer	1	1	1	0
Hoffnung am Horizont	1	1	0	1
Die Menschlichkeit auf dem Prüfstand	1	1	1	0

Ein Felssturz nach Verwit- terung	1	1	1	0
Staaten geben Zusagen für den Klimaschutz	1	1	1	0
Sydney Morning Herald				
A tectonic jolt might be enough	1	1	1	0
Ships latest helpers: a fleet of robots	1	1	1	0
Red petrol guzzler the pick for green council's new mayor	1	1	0	1
Bali: at least the world is talking	1	1	1	0
As the ice melts, Australia confronts the cold, hard facts	1	1	1	0
Other cities sign up to turn off	1	1	1	0
'So', she says, 'who ex- actly appointed you as Minister for Energy for this family?'	1	1	1	0
Faith in business plum- mets	1	1	1	0
Taxpayers face \$15b power sale sting	1	1	1	0
Burying coal fumes a "smokescreen"	1	1	1	0
Out with fossil fuel subsi- dies and in with a carbon tax	1	1	1	0

Ambitious targets in greenhouse proposal	1	1	1	0
Slow progress on clean coal projects	1	1	1	0
Column 8, 02.10.2011	1	1	1	0
Business wants carbon tax of \$10, plus exemp- tions	1	1	1	0
Temperature soaring to new highs	1	1	1	0
No doubt about it, the fu- ture is still up in the air	1	1	1	0
No, you're not dreaming, it's a white Christmas	1	1	0	1
Future cyclones could be more extreme: Garnaut	1	1	1	0
Why the critics are wrong on cycle lanes	1	1	1	0
The Age				
Rich urgent to cut emis- sions	1	1	1	0
Local niche for drought expertise	1	1	1	0
Time to celebrate our ice poles	1	1	1	0
Don't panic, power is not too far away	1	1	1	0

Melding sustainability and design	1	1	1	0
City lessons no stroll up the garden path	1	1	1	0
You're a pack of weather wimps	1	1	1	0
Australian researchers challenge Stern report's findings	1	1	1	0
Getting responsibility can deliver strong investment returns	1	1	1	0
Can't talk busy, busy	1	1	1	0
Climate change needs a plain English guide	1	1	1	0
Life under Gillard could be an expensive business	1	1	1	0
Railing at the Mexican Standoff	1	1	0	1
Wotif a rich man helped the Greens?	1	1	1	0
The ideology of endless growth	1	1	1	0
In praise of stimulus	1	1	1	0
Aussie envoys stuck in an age of Morse codes	1	1	1	0
Secrets behind weird sci- ence	1	1	1	0

Summe Coefficient			71	9
Carbon tax is a first step in climate fight	1	1	0	1
Of drought, flooding, rains and climate change	1	1	1	0

## Appendix C: Calculation of the weighted average coefficient

## Weighted average coefficient/Framing

Frame Dimension	Percentage of appearance	Coefficient	Percentage of appear- ance multiplied by coefficient
Problem Definition	47 per cent	0.98	46.1
Causal Interpretation (causes of climate change)	9 per cent	0.87	7.7
Causal Interpretation (effects of climate change)	21 per cent	0.80	16.5
Responsibility	3 per cent	0.40	1.2
Treatment recommen- dation	21 per cent	0.74	15.2
Weighted average coefficient			86,7